



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Linda Williams (Chair), Dawn Hill-Holdgate (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, David Barham, Diane Coombs
Associate Commissioners: Jascin Leonardo-Finger, Abigail Camp **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder

~~ MINUTES ~~

October 1, 2013 – OLD BUSINESS

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room –5:00 p.m.

Called to order at 5:05 p.m.

Staff in attendance: M. Voigt, HDC Administrator; T. Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp

Absent Members: Barham

Late Arrivals: Coombs 5:09 p.m.

Early Departures: Hill-Holdgate 7:35 p.m.; McLaughlin 8:55 p.m.

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

1. Dolceamore – 60294	80 Washington Street – HSAB	Hardscaping: fence	42.2.3-201	Riley, James
2. Brant Point Prop. (RMS) – 60295	Easy St & Old North Wharf	New sign: wall sign	42.3.1-17	RMS
3. Cape Cod Five – 60296	112 Pleasant Street	New sign: wall sign	55-149	J. Novak
4. Cape Cod Five – 60297	112 Pleasant Street	New sign: wall sign	55-149	J. Novak
5. Fitzpatrick – 60298	13 Plum Street	Revisions: COA 59804,59805	80-29	C. Noury-Ello
6. Hardlick, Neil – 60299	4 Dovekie Court – SAB	Deck	68-563	Self

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None

Public None

Concerns **Staff** – Stated he did not recommend Item 1 for consent.

Williams – Said she went to the site and met with the applicant to ensure he had done what the commission asked. Stated the applicant has submitted a detailed written account of what was being done in lieu of drawings.

Staff – A comment from the last meeting is that the plans are not clear and the location of the air-conditioning units (A/C) was not noted on the plans. Staff needs something to stamp and issue back and use for an inspection.

McLaughlin – Would like Item 1 to be pulled from the list as he has not had the chance to review what has been submitted.

Motion **Motion to Approve Item 1 through staff with a sketch plan showing the locations. (Hill-Holdgate)**

Motion to Approve the rest of the consent agenda. (Hill-Holdgate)

Vote Carried 4-0/McLaughlin abstain

Certificate # **60294 to 60299**

Carried 4-0/McLaughlin abstain

III. HARDSCAPING: TOWN BICYCLE RACKS – DISCUSSION

Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs Leonardo-Finger, Camp		
Alternates	N/A		
Recused	N/A		
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.		
Representing	Mike Burns , Transportation Planner Planning and Land Use Services – The Town Manager requested the proposed bike racks be forwarded to the HDC for comment and its recommendation. Stated that more bike racks have been identified as something that is needed in the downtown area.		
Public	N/A		
Concerns	<p>(5:13) Hill-Holdgate – Concerned with the way these would visually make a mass of bikes as opposed to head-in bike racks. Would prefer regular bike racks made of wood or with a matte finish. Do not like the silver racks.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No, not on Nantucket; these racks that were installed are the worst things he has seen. Prefers the old all-wood racks.</p> <p>Coombs – Agree with Mr. McLaughlin. They take up too much room on the sidewalk and the bikes fall over.</p> <p>Leonardo-Finger – Agree with what’s been said: should remain wood, the metal is deceiving and they don’t look like bike racks. Metal bollards will create a fence of bicycles making it hard to use the sidewalk.</p> <p>Camp – Agree.</p> <p>Williams – Agree. People will walk into these at night. They need to stay wood, need to stay subdued and need to be repaired. The bollards are doing permanent damage to sidewalks, which is not appropriate.</p>		
Motion	Motion to send a letter of concern signed by the chair to the Department of Public Works and Town Manager asking to remove the bike racks. (McLaughlin)		
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	

IV. 60-DAY DENIALS

1. Gudonis	72 Union Street – HSAB	Renovation	55.1.4-94	Self
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:26) Staff – The applicant was contacted about what the HDC required per HSAB comments but no response was received.			
Motion	Motion to Deny due to lack of response to requests for changes and further information: transom not drawn correctly, need a window survey, not everything bubbled so it was not clear what was being proposed, windows need to be true-divided light which was unclear on the application as both “TDL” and “SDL” were checked, the front door needs to remain, the drawing looks different, the 2-over-2 windows should remain, trim to remain grey, and needed better drawings in general as it was too difficult to figure out all of the details. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60300	

V. OLD BUSINESS/QUORUM

1. Murray, Gail	62 Lovers Lane	Revisions: move-on	79-27	Twig Perkins
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Liz Scavila , Twig Perkins – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	<p>(5:29) Staff – Read previous concerns.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60301	

2.	Houlihan/Morash	13 Hedgebury Lane	Dwelling	60.2.1-6	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Val Oliver – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.				
	Jeff Morash – Stated that the colors would be changed to match the cottage.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:32) Staff – Read previous concerns from Sept. 5.				
	Coombs – No concerns; they did what we asked.				
	Camp – West elevation, the dormer with the French door seems large.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with cobblestone trim and green sash. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60302	
7.	Jelleme	3 Pilgrim Court	Revisions: fenestration	41-612	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Hill-Holdgate, Leonardo-Finger				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Present project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:43) Staff – Read application specifications.				
	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60303	
3.	Vogel, Gary	22 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Cottage	73-133	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:35) Staff – Read previous concerns from Aug. 1. (McLaughlin stepped out, held for his return.)				
	(5:45) McLaughlin – The three windows on the left. Agree with Ms Williams. South elevation dormer should be dropped so meeting rail lines up.				
	Camp – Nothing to add.				
	Williams – None of the windows line up on any elevation. On the front, the smaller windows should be on the 2 nd floor. East elevation, too many ganged the windows; 2 nd floor should be a window and a door. South elevation, dormers need to go up or be flush not have the windows at the eave, French door in a shed dormer is inappropriate. North elevation has same ganged problem and eaves across the bottom of the windows and the huge “A” windows.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
4.	Vogel, Gary	22 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Garage	73-133	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes per previous concerns. Disagree about the pent roof; stated it alleviates the illusion of height.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:50) Staff – Read previous concerns from Aug. 1.				
	Camp – Okay with the pent roof. Garage cross bucks should be interior.				
	McLaughlin – The “F” window should be a double hung 9-over-9.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the straight brackets and cross bucks removed from the garage door. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60304	

5.	Vogel, Gary	22 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Pool	73-133	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Asked for this to be held.				
Public	None				
Concerns	No comments at this time				
Motion	Motion to Hold at applicant's request. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried		Certificate #		
6.	Oak Hill Investment	7 South Valley Road	Revisions: dwelling	43-143	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes per previous concerns. Contends south elevation first floor is not visible. For the record, protested the reopening of the project for the purpose of making a new motion.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:54) Staff – Read previous concerns from Sept. 5. Camp – Only concern is the large window units on the 1 st floor of the south elevation. McLaughlin – Meeting rails do not line up. Williams – Not concerned about the meeting rails because of the large overhang. The 2 nd floor deck is over fenestrated and should have a single door. South elevation, when the sun hits the large panes, the reflection will be visible; they need mullions and should have French doors.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with French doors on the south elevation in place of the plate windows and a single French door on the north elevation. (Camp) Carried unanimously Motion to Reopen. (Camp) Carried unanimously Motion to Approve through staff with French doors on the south elevation in place of the plate windows and a single French door on the north elevation and dove grey trim and sash and the doors natural to weather. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate # 60305		
7.	Oak Hill Investment	7 South Valley Road	Tracking: pool	43-143	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development Miroslava Ahern				
Public	None				
Concerns	(6:03) Staff – No previous concerns. It was held to track with the house. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate # 60306		

8. Oak Hill Investment	7 South Valley Road	Tracking: garage/studio	43-143	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Presented project. All structures on South Valley except one have white trim. Will go dove grey trim and sash with the people doors black and garage doors natural to weather.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:06) Staff – No previous comments. Hill-Holdgate – It is large structure on a small lot and close to the road; the posts will stand out too much if they are white. Coombs – Agree about the white trim and posts. Would prefer the cream to be one shade darker. Camp – Would be okay with the cream and grey but would like to see paint samples. McLaughlin – The brackets should be 45 degrees. Columns should be 4X4 square not tapered. Williams – No white due to the size and design of the house; it is a large shingle style. Discussion about why white is not appropriate on this structure.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff 45 degree bracket Dove grey trim and sash with the people doors black and garage doors natural to weather.			
Vote	Carried 4-1/McLaughlin opposed	Certificate #	60307	
9. Oak Hill Investment	7 S. Valley Road	Tracking: shed/cabana	43-143	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Presented project. Shower and pergola are natural to weather.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:16) Staff – Not previously discussed. Hill-Holdgate – No concerns as long as colors match the garage and house. No other concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the pergola and shower natural to weather and trim and sash colors to match the garage. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60308	
10. 4 Saratoga Ln LLC	14 Tennessee Avenue – MAB	Demo	60.1.2-6	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Hill-Holdgate,			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Val Oliver – In 2007, a demolition was approved. Mike Dagesse – Black mold issue and floor system is gone.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:21) Staff – No previous comments.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as a demo or move. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 4-0/Leonardo-Finger abstain	Certificate #	60309	

11. 4 Saratoga Ln LLC	14 Tennessee Avenue – MAB	New dwelling as approved	60.1.2-6	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Hill-Holdgate			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Val Oliver – Want to start from scratch with it looking like the previously approved structure. Mike Dagesse			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:21) Staff – No previous comments. MAB – Approvable as previously approved alteration. McLaughlin & Coombs – No concerns. Leonardo-Finger – Big dormer facing the water with French doors and windows, that’s a lot of glazing facing the water. Camp – Agree with Leonardo-Finger. Williams – Agree, it is too much glass facing the water. Discussion about removing some of the glazing facing Hither Creek.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation 2nd-floor deck middle windows become one centered and the triple ganged in the middle section becoming 2 separated windows. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 4-0/Leonardo-Finger abstain	Certificate #	60310	
12. Kumin	17 Head of Plains	Hardscaping: pergola, kitchen	63-56	M. Ahern
Sitting	Hill-Holdgate (acting), McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Williams			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Miroslava Ahern – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:34) Staff – No previous comments. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 4-1/Leonardo-Finger opposed	Certificate #	60311	
VI. OLD BUSINESS/VIEWS				
13. Beardsley, Scott	138 Main Street	Hardscaping: solar panels	41-521	Self
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Jeff Remick – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:37) Staff – Read HSAB comments. Hill-Holdgate – The way they are located is okay. McLaughlin – Might be visible from the abutters’ way off Vestal Street. Coombs – It might be difficult to see them. It will be interesting to see if they work and fit in. Leonardo-Finger – No serious concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to limited visibility and location on the south side relatively flat roof. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 4-0/McLaughlin abstain	Certificate #	60312	

14. Dunphy, Maureen	32 Tennessee Avenue	Hardscaping: walkway	60.1.2-32/41	Thornewill Design
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Carrie Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project. The gate is not part of the application.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:43) Staff – No previous comments. Hill-Holdgate – Believe this type of walkway has been approved before, but they run from someone's house so they aren't visible from a public way. That white material is not appropriate when visible. It is not traditional material, too high off the ground and completely visible. Williams – The entire area was cut down and the whole thing is visible from I Street and from Hither Creek. Camp – Holding any comments. Coombs – Asked why it didn't go along I Street instead of down the middle of this property. Agree with Hill-Holdgate. The cap on the handrail is inappropriate. Walkway should be no higher than 24 inches off the ground. Would prefer to see another layout. McLaughlin – The materials are inappropriate. Work has started and should be removed; there is no permit for it. It should not be more than 18 inches above the ground and made of wood. Williams – The elevated boardwalk is inappropriate. There is no other elevated board walk on Tennessee that starts nowhere and goes nowhere. The steps come down right onto Tennessee Avenue. They have used concrete that has spilled all over the wetlands.			
Motion	Motion to Deny due to architectural inappropriateness because it is elevated, inappropriate material, is visible, there are no other walkways on the street, the posts are too large, and is not in keeping with the neighborhood; the staff is to look into the violation and ascertain the fine for the unapproved work that was done. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60313	
15. Nantucket Land Bank	4 Codfish Park Road	Hardscaping: playground	73.2.4-42	GDC
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Julie Jordin , The Garden Design Company – Thinks it is important to realize that we are beyond whirly-gigs and seesaws and that it is a challenge to stimulate children. The designer is an artist who works solely in natural materials. The structures are all 10 feet and under Siobhan Mahoney – Have looked at playground designers, who didn't meet our standards. Believes the design reflects the whaling history of the area. Have a large amount of community support and private funding for a public and open site; therefore, see it as fulfilling the Land Bank mission.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:58) Staff – Read previous concerns from Sept. 24. Hill-Holdgate – Asked for no treatment on any of the wood, it should all be natural to weather. Believes the playground design is appropriate. Coombs – Asked about the massing and stature of the ship element. Thinks it will fit in as brush grows up around it. Would like the slide to be grey or darker. McLaughlin – Too busy and there is no parking. The ship element is completely out of whack. The lighthouse seems to have no purpose. Leonardo-Finger – Agree with Mr. McLaughlin. There are too many pieces to this puzzle. It will be visible from everywhere and does not fit in with a fishing village. Williams – It is a large lot with perimeter screening.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with all wood natural to weather and all plastic and metal elements to be gun-metal grey. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried 3-1/Leonardo-Finger opposed McLaughlin abstain	Certificate #	60314	

Break 7:11 to 7:19 p.m.

16. Sackton/Butman	12 Hinckley Lane	Renovation	30-230	C. Thornewill
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Carrie Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project. Brad Butman , Owner – Built in 1951 and renovated in 1972.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:19) Staff – No previous comments. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility and the renovation is in concert with the existing structure. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60315	
17. Delano, Chris	5 Longwood Drive	New barn	71-45	K. Snell
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Kyle Snell – Presented project. Chris Delano , owner – Willing to remove the vents.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:24) Staff – No previous comments. Hill-Holdgate – Gable vents should be square or removed. Leonardo-Finger – Agree about the vents.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with shingled siding and no gable vents. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60316	
18. Wilson, Steve	5 Surfside Road	New second dwelling	55-253	K. Snell
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Hill-Holdgate			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Kyle Snell – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:28) Staff – No previous concerns. No concerns			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60317	
19. Wilson, Steve	5 Surfside Road	Shed	55-253	Structures Unltd.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Hill-Holdgate			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Kyle Snell – Presented project. Paige Holdgate, Structure Unlimited.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:31) No concerns. McLaughlin – Seven is the minimum pitch for a gable roof.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with a 7-pitch roof.			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60318	

20. Wilson, Steve	5 Surfside Road	Move off: garage	55-253	Structures Unltd.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Hill-Holdgate			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Kyle Snell – Presented project. Paige Holdgate , Structure Unlimited – Offering to take the structure.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:34) No concerns			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60319	
21. Glowacki	2 Greglen Avenue	Move on: garage	68-131	Structures Unltd.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Hill-Holdgate			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Kyle Snell Paige Holdgate , Structure Unlimited – Explained where it is going on Greglen Avenue			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:34) No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60320	
22. Attapreyangkul, T.	3 Monohansett Avenue	New dwelling	79-150.1	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Val Oliver – Presented project. Kenny Attapreyangkul Chu Attapreyangkul			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:35) Coombs – This is not visible as long as nothing is cut down. Leonardo-Finger – No concerns as long as it is not visible. Camp – Would like the windows to have grills. McLaughlin – Everything about the 3 rd floor is visible.			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to the remote location and minimal visibility. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60321	
23. Cross, Mary	4 Hulbert Avenue	Addition	42.1.4-2	E. McMorrow
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Bo Wilson – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:42) Staff – Read HSAB comments. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 4-0/Leonardo-Finger abstain	Certificate #	60322	

24. Powers, Chris	69 Surfside Road (Lot A)	New dwelling	67-230	D. Gardenier
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Denise Gardenier – Presented project; trim color is at the discretion of the board.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:44) Staff – No previous concerns. Application states natural to weather trim and white sashes. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60323	
25. Block-Kelley	3 Sherburne Turnpike	Demo garage/studio	30-114	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:46) Staff – No previous concerns. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move or demo. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60324	
26. Block-Kelley	3 Sherburne Turnpike	New garage/studio	30-114	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:47) Staff – No previous concerns. McLaughlin – No comment. Coombs – Would prefer the shutters to be Essex green. Leonardo-Finger – Agree about the shutters and the bumpout issue. Camp – No comments. Williams – Too close to the street; right bumpout needs to be set off more than 1 foot and move to the center of that side. Garage doors on the gable make it look like your driving into the body of the house.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried 4-1/McLaughlin opposed	Certificate #		
27. Squam Head LLC	71 Squam Road	Partial demo, addition	13-12	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:55) Staff – No previous commissioner concerns. Read HSAB comments. Coombs – Chimney should not be removed. Leonardo-Finger – Chimney should not be removed. Williams – West elevation windows are too large and bisect a corner board; should be “E” windows.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the chimney to remain and the west elevation left “A” windows to become “E” windows and move away from the corner post. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60325	

28. Fallon	16 Starbuck Road – MAB	Addition: dormer	60-115	BPC
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Joe Paul , BPC – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:01) Staff – No previous commissioner concerns. Coombs – Okay with filling in the deck; Leonardo-Finger – The 2-over-2 windows are too busy. Williams – All windows should be 1-over-1 or 2-over-8; the “B” and “A” windows should go to clear light.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with “A” & “B” windows to become clear double hung. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60326	
29. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Addition	80-196	BPC
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:05) Staff – Do not have minutes from the last hearing; do not know who was sitting.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 3 meeting. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
30. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Garage	80-196	BPC
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:05) Staff – Do not have minutes from the last hearing; do not know who was sitting.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 3 meeting. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
31. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Hardscaping: pool	80-196	BPC
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:05) Staff – Do not have minutes from the last hearing; do not know who was sitting.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 3 meeting. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
32. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Cabana	80-196	BPC
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:05) Staff – Do not have minutes from the last hearing; do not know who was sitting.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 3 meeting. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

33. LTS Ginger	5 Blackfish Lane – SAB	New dwelling	73-122	Workshop/APD
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen , Workshop/APD – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:08) Staff – No previous commissioner concerns. Coombs – Cross bucks are not appropriate with the 2-over-2 windows. Not fond of lights on one side of the front door. The chimney shouldn't be a block going up the side; it should be corbelled. Leonardo-Finger – Agree with Ms Coombs. Cap on the chimney is not appropriate. West elevation large window will be visible and is not appropriate. Agree about the single sidelight on the front door. Ganged windows in the dormer are not appropriate. Camp – Nothing to add. McLaughlin – West elevation, the large window is not appropriate. Williams – Agree about the cross bucks and single sidelights. South elevation windows need to line up; “F” windows need to line up; house needs to read as a three bay. “G” windows are too large for an ancillary element. South elevation dormer is off-kilter. Chimney is oversized and should be interior. East elevation dormer is too large with too much wall plane and three sets of ganged windows.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
34. LTS Ginger	5 Blackfish Lane – SAB	New shed	73-122	Workshop/APD
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop/APD			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:17) No comments.			
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the house.			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
35. Bluefin Partners LLC	16 Ellens Way	New dwelling	81-6	Workshop/APD
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen , Workshop/APD – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:18) Staff – No previous commissioner comments. Leonardo-Finger – Chimney is not appropriate. North elevation balcony and doors are too heavy. Chaotic fenestration. Coombs – South elevation dormer with the two little “E” windows should be brought in tighter. Agree about the chimney. Ganged windows on the west elevation 2 nd floor should be three windows separated. Camp – No further comments. McLaughlin – The seven awning windows should be fixed or hoppers. Williams – A chimney of this size does not belong on a small 1-story structure. Same with the dormer. The 2-over-2 and 6-over-6 windows are not appropriate. Door should not have glass in it. The “B” windows are not appropriate. West elevation left 2 nd -floor deck is inappropriate. The “C” windows are too small. South elevation, the dormer should not bisect the roof line.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

36. Bluefin Partners LLC	26 Ellens Way	New dwelling	81-6	Workshop/APD
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen , Workshop/APD – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:25) Staff – No previous commissioner comments. Coombs – The “C” windows look very wide. Chimney and front door are concerns. North elevation ganged windows should be separated. McLaughlin – No comment. Williams – Not the right design for 6-over-1, windows should be 6-over-6; front door is a problem. Need A/C located on the site plan.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
37. Bluefin Partners LLC	28 Ellens Way	New dwelling	81-6	Workshop/APD
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen , Workshop/APD – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:30) Staff – No previous commissioner comments. Leonardo-Finger – Chimney cap is not appropriate. Coombs – South and north elevation, dormers should be smaller or brought down more. McLaughlin – A/C on the south elevation will be visible from the road. Williams – Windows are too wide, they are horizontal. North elevation windows need to be separated and lined up. South and north elevation dormers are too wide.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
38. Atlas RT	212 Eel Point Road	Hardscaping: pool	38-35	Atlantic Landscap.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lindsey Congelton, Atlantic Landscaping			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:35) Staff – No quorum: previously Williams, Hill-Holdgate & McLaughlin			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 3 meeting. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
39. Minella, Amy	8 Giny Lane	Hardscaping	82-51	W. Yost
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	Staff – Have a request to hold for Thursday.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of October 3 meeting at applicant’s request. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

40. Doughan/Duersten	16 Orange Street – HSAB	Gazebo renovation	42.3.2-14	CWA
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ethan Griffin , Chip Webster Architecture – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:36) Staff – Read previous concerns from Sept. 1 and HSAB comments. Leonardo-Finger – It is still too big.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 4-0/Leonardo-Finger abstain	Certificate #	60327	

VII. OLD BUSINESS

41. Duty	5 Warren Street – HSAB	Hardscaping: A/C encl.	55.4.1-93	M. Ahern
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Miroslava Ahern – Found a smaller unit and redesigned the enclosure.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:39) Staff – Read previous concerns from Sept. 24. Leonardo-Finger – Still says on the plan that there is an outdoor shower. No other commissioner concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with natural to weather board fence and no shower. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60328	
42. Lipp, Wendy	2 Sesachacha Road	Garage	21-88	BPC
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Context photos submitted at the table.			
Representing	Doug Mills , BPC – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:41) Staff – Read previous concerns from July 30. McLaughlin – West elevation awning window should be fixed or hopper. Coombs – There should be shutters on the windows on the 1 st floor of the south elevation. Camp – No concerns. Williams – Agree about the shutters on the south elevation. West elevation, the deck is crammed with glass; should be one door and two windows. Consensus agrees. East elevation the ganged dormer windows should be separated.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with west elevation 1 door and 1 window separated, east elevation ganged windows separated, south elevation add shutters to the 1st floor windows, north elevation going to vertical board natural to weather on the doors, and the 6-lights to be hoppers. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60329	

43. Steinberg, Diane	18 East Tristram's Avenue	Rev: COA #58282	31-33.1	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Reviewed changes per previous concerns. Steven Cohen, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, Gifford & Cohen LLP			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:50) Williams signed the form attesting that she had reviewed all the application information and can sit on the project. Staff – Read previous concerns from Sept. 19. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60330	
44. Miner	12 South Valley Road	Cottage	43-139	JMS Architecture
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Sarah Alger, Sarah F. Alger P.C.			
Public	None			
Concerns	Lost the quorum with Mr. McLaughlin's departure. Sitting: Leonardo-Finger Hill-Holdgate McLaughlin & Williams			
Motion	Held for October 3 meeting due to lack of quorum			
Vote	Carried None	Certificate #		
45. Abramson, Leigh	3 Charter Street – HSAB	Window: door change	42.3.2-120	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:57) Staff – Read previous concerns from Sept. 17. No concerns except for the ganged windows on the south elevation			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with reuse of north elevation original window on the west elevation and south elevation left ganged windows to be separated and centered. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60331	
46. Kilvert	4 Darling Street – HSAB	Revisions	42.3.2-19	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Williams, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(9:01) Staff – Read previous concerns from Sept. 17. Coombs – No concerns. Leonardo-Finger – The original 4-over-4 windows on the east and south elevation need to be reused.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the east 4-over-4 window and the south 1st floor 4-over-4 to be reused left of the south elevation new back door. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60332	

47. Davison	8 North Water Street – HSAB	Hardscaping	42.4.2-92	C. Skehel
Sitting	Williams, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Chris Skehel , The Castle Group – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(9:12) Staff – Read HSAB comments and previous concerns from Aug. 20. Camp – Believes it cleans up the whole street going up toward the Jared Coffin House. Coombs – Would like to know what type of stone will be used in the retaining wall. Leonardo-Finger – Not in favor of a sidewalk on Ash Lane. Williams – The side walk connecting the back to the front is a lot of brick. The rubbish enclosure is in the set back. The apron is too wide; it cannot exceed 18 feet and I will not approve it. Discussion about how to fix the apron.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with elimination of the shed on the west property line, the entrances to the two parking spaces delineated from the sidewalk with Belgium block flush with the brick, and using dry-laid rounded stone for the retaining wall per Exhibit A. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 3-1/Leonardo-Finger opposed	Certificate #	60333	

Motion to Hold the following items for the October 3 meeting. (Coombs) Carried unanimously

48. Cribbins	68 Sankaty Road – SAB	Garage revisions	49-187	Shelter 7
49. Westfall	30 Monomoy Road	Hardscaping: pool	54-210	CWA
50. Sarah Alger, N.T.	93 Squam Road	Revisions	13-1	Rowland
51. Lynch, Michael	58A Orange Street – HSAB	Revisions	55.4.1-792	SMRD
52. Morency	11 Mark Hawk Lane	Addition	56-112	N. McMullen
53. Bazinet	15 Burnell Street – SAB	New dwelling	73.4.2-48.1	D. Wiley
54. Oak Hill Investments	40 Long Pond Road – MAB	Move on	594-115	Emeritus
55. Halberstam	12 Coffin Street – HSAB	Addition		Emeritus
56. Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	Revisions: new dwelling	30-193	Emeritus
57. Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	Move/demo	30-193	Emeritus
58. Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	New garage	30-193	Emeritus
59. Panner, Aaron	Crooked Lane (Lot 4)	Rev: COA #59915 (main hse)	41-205	Botticelli & Pohl
60. FAO NT	29 Orange Street – HSAB	Renovation/additions	42.3.2-69	Botticelli & Pohl
61. Cohan	81 Baxter Road – SAB	Move on-site, renovation	49-33	C & C
62. Burns, Brett	24 Nonantum Avenue	New dwelling	87-157	Emeritus
63. NHA	15R Vestal Street – HSAB	New sign: free-standing sign	73-133	Emeritus
64. Hunter Trust	90 Pocomo Road	New dwelling	15-43	CWA
65. Hunter Trust	90 Pocomo Road	New second dwelling	15-43	CWA
66. Hunter Trust	90 Pocomo Road	New garage	15-43	CWA
67. Glenhurst West RT	137 Cliff Road	New dwelling	30-259	CWA

VIII. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes	August 20 and 22 and September 3, 5, 12, 17 and 19 - Held
Review Minutes	September 24
Other Business	Organizational meeting October 29 th with the regular meeting schedule adjusted.
Commission Comments	None

Motion to Adjourn: 9:31 p.m.

Submitted by:
Terry L. Norton

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board
TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board